

Note of Common Language Group (CLG) meeting held at Friends House, London. Tuesday 20 March 2018

For the CLG minutes and meeting presentations see:

<http://www.seafish.org/responsible-sourcing/discussion-forums/the-common-language-group>

1. Welcome, introductions and apologies

Mike Kaiser (Bangor University and Chair of the CLG) welcomed everyone to the meeting.

Attendees

Adam Rees	Blue Marine Foundation
Alex Olsen	Espersen
Alice Miller	IPNLF
Amy Hill	ClientEarth
Andrew Lucas	Defra
Anna Wallis	Seafood Festivals Ltd
Armelle Huille	Embassy of France in London
Britta Gallus	Metro
Caroline Bennett	Sole of Discretion
Cassie Leisk	New England Seafood
Chantelle Williams	Fresh from the Boat
Charles Kilgour	OceanMind
Colin Charman	Natural Resources Wales
Dale Rodmell	NFFO
Dan McGlynn	Authenticate IS
Daniel Owen	Fenners Chambers
Daniel Suddaby	Ocean Outcomes
Emma Crane	Marine Conservation Society
Erin Priddle	Environmental Defense Fund
George Clark	Marine Stewardship Council
Helen Duggan	Seafish
Helen McLachlan	WWF UK
Hirohiko Matsukusa	Caistor Seafoods Ltd
Iain Pollard	Key Traceability Ltd
Iain Shone	Global Aquaculture Alliance
Ian Rolmanis	Sustainable Fisheries Partnership
James Robertson	Joseph Robertson (Aberdeen) Ltd
Jamie Davies	Pew Trusts
Jenny Barker	FishWise
Jeremy Langley	Waitrose
Jimmy Buchan	Scottish Seafood Association
Jo Anderson	Defra
John Hooper	Marine & Fisheries Management Solutions
John Pearce	MRAG
Julie Poirot	Embassy of France in London

Karen Green	Seafish (Minutes)
Laky Zervudachi	Direct Seafoods
Leanne Ayres	Defra
Libby Woodhatch	Seafish
Malcolm Morrison	Scottish Fishermen's Federation
Mariah Boyle	FishWise
Marnie Woods	Defra
Martin Cooke	World Animal Protection
Martin Jaffa	Callander MacDowell
Max Goulden	MacAlister Elliott & Partners Ltd
Max Schmid	Environmental Justice Foundation
Mike Berthet	Global Aquaculture Alliance
Mike Kaiser	Bangor University (Chair)
Mike Mitchell	Young's Seafood
Mike Short	Seafood Industry Alliance
Nathan Droesch	WWF DE
Nicola Blacker	Defra
Oliver Tanqueray	Sustainable Seafood Coalition
Owain Wynn-Jones	Offshore Shellfish
Phil Taylor	Open Seas
Rhiannon Holden	Project UK
Rodney Anderson	Greenwich Forum
Sam Peacock	RS Standards
Sarah Johnson	Alaska Seafood Marketing Institute
Stella Bartolini-Cavicchi	Defra
Tracy Cambridge	Thai Union

Apologies

Aisla Jones	Co-op
Alison Austen	Seafish Board
Alistair Douglas	EachMile Technologies Pte. Ltd.
Alma Bonilla	Joseph Robertson (Aberdeen) Ltd
Andrew Kuyk	Seafood Industry Alliance
Andy Hickman	Tesco
Andy Matchett	Coombe Fisheries
Barry Harland	Whitby Seafoods Ltd
Blake Lee-Harwood	Sustainable Fisheries Partnership
Chiara Vitali	World Animal Protection
Claire Pescod	Marine Stewardship Council
Claire Sammons	Lovering Foods Ltd
Darius Campbell	NEAFC
David Jarrad	SAGB
David Schorr	WWF US
Debbie Cook	Seafish
Eric Giry	Embassy of France in London
Huw Thomas	Pew Trusts
John Butler	Oscar Mayer Group
Katie Miller	ClientEarth
Mike Brummitt	Regal Fish Supplies Ltd
Mike Warner	SAGB
Neil Auchterlonie	IFFO

Nick Neeld	The Big Prawn Company
Rick Sanderson	Authenticate
Sarah Pilgrim-Morrison	MacDuff Shellfish
Scott Johnston	Young's Seafood
Tom Evans	Key Traceability Ltd

2. Minutes from the last meeting held on 16 November 2017.

The final minutes were accepted as a true reflection of the meeting and have been added to the CLG web page. Attendees were asked to take note of the meeting guidelines. In the following minutes Seafish will provide a link to the various presentations given at the meeting but not summarise the whole presentation. In the main we do not attribute the comments made at the meeting. Papers were sent round and tabled covering the activities of the other Seafish groups (Aquaculture, Discards, Ethics and Skates and Rays) and a list of forthcoming seafood events. A full list can be found on the Seafish website: <http://www.seafish.org/about-seafish/news-and-events/events>

Improving access to market in the UK

3. Fresh from the Boat. Chantelle Lewis.

Chantelle explained the premise behind Fresh from the Boat which was to sell local sustainable fish to local people. In 2013, 80% of their catch went to market and they were paid low value for good grade sustainable fish. They were faced with many issues: no consistent quota, reactive Governmental management, no local auction market near us, lost coastal infrastructure, fishermen's moorings no longer exist, higher transport costs. They now sell from their own boat and support other local boats and have seen a 25-30% uplift in price; have established a Community Fish Box which has over 100 members weekly when in season; they sell their fish direct to restaurants, fishmongers and farm shops and offer home delivery five days a week.

Action: Circulate link.

4. Sole of Discretion. Caroline Bennett.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752246/clg_mar2018_soleofdiscretion.pdf

Caroline explained Sole of Discretion is a Community Interest Fishmonger, based in Plymouth, which is owned by the fishers that land to it. Fishers can land, process and sell their own fish, offering full traceability through the supply chain. They work only with small-scale boats of under 10m mostly static netters, line caught, pots and pelagic trawls. The fishers are paid a fair price which is agreed in advance (usually 10-15% above market price). This could provide a model for others to copy in other parts of the country. Transport has been one of the biggest issues and there has to be an acceptance of blast-freezing if continuity of supply from under 10m vessels is going to be a reality.

Discussion

- **Question.** What is customer perception of Sole of Discretion? **Answer.** We use Farmdrop which is an online food delivery company that distributes foods to consumers that is sourced from local farmers and fishermen. The company provides farm-to-table foods and fresh fish for consumers in the London, Bristol and Bath areas and is growing. The 'catch of the day' idea has appeal.
- It is not typical for the CLG to hear from small-scale catchers and this has been refreshing. We often hear about the inherent antagonism between small-scale

and large-scale producers and the issues each sector faces. Airing those views is what the Common Language Group is all about.

- **Q.** How did the link with the Soil Association and their move into wild caught fish come about? **A.** The Soil Association (essentially an organic agriculture standard) has allowed Sole of Discretion to display its logo as an endorsement of its whole ethical, quality and British ethos. This is not certification but a recognition of our principles of operation and manifesto.

Action: Circulate link.

5. Scottish Seafood Association. Jimmy Buchan.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752252/clg_mar2018_amity.pdf

Jimmy explained the difficulty for small scale producers - getting great products to customers often fails because of poor logistics. This restricts growth as the larger companies dominate the market. Amity Ltd helped solve this problem by collaborating with other local suppliers specifically an ice-cream supplier and a farm shop restaurant for his breaded scampi by sharing product, transport and customers.

6. Reserve Seafood 2017. Adam Rees, Blue Marine Foundation.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752255/clg_mar2018_bluemarinefoundation.pdf

Reserve Seafood is a partnership between BLUE, the Lyme Bay Fisheries and Conservation Reserve and national wholesaler Direct Seafoods to market sustainable, premium quality, provenance-assured seafood from Lyme Bay at a higher price than previously enjoyed. Infrastructure is provided - chiller units and ice making facilities allows fish to be iced and stored as soon as it is lifted onto the boats. This enables fishermen to supply a range of fish of the highest quality and utilise all their catch. To sell through Reserve Seafood fishermen must be: signed up to the Reserve code of conduct; transmitting iVMS data to prove they are fishing in the Reserve; accredited to the Seafish Responsible Fishing Scheme; and adhering to monitoring area requirements measuring levels of fishing effort. In addition valuable catch data is contributing to understanding the marine environment. 29 species of seafood were sold through Reserve Seafood in 2016. The ability to make use of all species caught has meant more varied types of fish are being recorded in the Reserve. Species such as bass, cuttlefish and turbot have low populations on a national level. The rise in the frequency of landings may be an indication that healthy local populations are returning for some species.

Discussion

- **Question.** You are supplying the London foodservice market. Are there any issues of over supply by fishers? **Answer.** There is still plenty of scope for growth in the market. Restaurants do take note of Marine Conservation Society ratings so this has to be a consideration.
- **Q.** How can this be scaled-up? **A.** We could go beyond working with vessels 10m and under. The 42 boats currently fish under a voluntary regulation through a code of conduct.

Action: Circulate link.

Tools and traceability initiatives to support access to market

7. Work that Metro is doing and the technology they are using. Britta Gallus, Metro AG.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752258/clg_mar2018_metrotraceabilitytools.pdf

Metro Pro Trace is a scalable general traceability approach which is applicable to food and non-food products on an internationally harmonised level. It covers sustainability

and safety aspects. Pro Trace captures scientific name, lot, fishing vessel, FAO fishing area, sub area, date of catch, production method, minimum durability and quantity. Customers can find information via the Pro Trace App. Moving forward the hope is that others will collaborate and ask for the same attributes.

8. Seafood Alliance for Legality and Traceability (SALT). Jenny Barker, FishWise.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752261/clg_mar2018_salt.pdf

SALT (Seafood Alliance for Legality and Traceability) is a global alliance for knowledge exchange and action to promote legal and sustainable fisheries through improved transparency in seafood supply chains. SALT brings together the seafood industry, governments and NGOs to accelerate learning and support collaboration on innovative solutions for legal and sustainable seafood, with a particular focus on traceability, the ability to track the movement of seafood through supply chains. The initiative has \$5M of funding (2018-2023) from USAID, Walton Family, David and Lucile Packard, and Gordon and Betty Moore Foundations. SALT is running three DataLabs, the first of which was in the US in December 2017 and has come up with a series of collaborative actions.

Action: Circulate link.

9. Global Dialogue on Seafood Traceability (GDST). Nathan Drosch, WWF DE.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752267/clg_mar2018_globaldialogue.pdf

The Dialogue principles are to: be pre-competitive/collaborative/industry-driven; create a platform to enable discussion but not be prescriptive; start with wild caught but include aquaculture; and identify future collaboration. The Dialogue has 35 members currently spread across three geographic regions. There are a number of working groups each with their own mandate.

Action: Circulate link.

General discussion

- **Question.** What is the lowest point in the supply chain that you can achieve traceability? **Answer.** This will be on the vessel.
- **Q.** Both SALT and GDST mention Government. What is your strategy to get Government engaged? **A.** Ultimately this is essential and attempts are being made to leverage engagement. As an example the SALT DataLab in Asia will piggy-back on another USAID event. It is important that there is co-operation and not duplication. It is likely that SALT and GDST will inform each other.
- **Comment.** 'I feel I am drowning in a transparency fog'. With these new foundations and programmes (two mentioned here and others) it is difficult to distinguish between them to be able to recommend any to seafood clients. We want a 'common language' and a combined initiative. This is not helpful and it would be useful to know where the FAO are in all this. **Response.** Six years ago these traceability initiatives were not really there so the fact they are now is progress. The hope is that they can all align going forward.

Brexit and the Fisheries Bill

10. Brexit and the Fisheries Bill – the Government Perspective. Jo Anderson, Defra.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752270/clg_mar2018_brexit_defra.pdf

Defra's exit work is organised into three main categories: negotiation, legislation and build.

The **White Paper** will set out our medium term vision for sustainable fisheries management of UK waters. This includes;

- our commitment to continue to promote sustainable fisheries
- our position on access to waters and quota setting
- consideration of a new UK framework with increased devolution once
- we leave the CFP our thinking on how to further reform English fisheries management
- to the benefit of both fishermen and the environment

The **European Union (Withdrawal) Bill**

- Will provide continuity, certainty and control as we leave the EU
- Converts EU law in to UK law – as retained EU law
- Repeals the European Communities Act
- Avoids any sudden changes on the day of exit and ensures we still have a functioning statute book
- Does not prejudice the outcome of the exit negotiations
- Does not make substantial policy changes – but does correct deficiencies so that UK laws are operable

The **Fisheries Bill**

- The Bill will return control to the UK
- To determine access to UK waters out to 200mn or the median line
- To determine fishing opportunities (through quota allocations or days at sea)
- The Bill will enable the UK to sustainably manage our Exclusive Economic Zone (EEZ) as an independent Coastal State
- The Bill will be small
- It will enable us to create a new regime. It will not create a new Regime

Action: Circulate link re feedback which can be sent to fishexit@defra.gsi.gov.uk

11. UK Seafood Industry Alliance. Mike Short, SIA.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752273/clg_mar2018_brexit_sia.pdf

Brexit presents a unique set of challenges. For most of the food industry, the primary impacts of Brexit relate to terms of trade, the availability of labour and future regulation. But seafood has the added complication of resolving future access to waters and catch quotas – as well as ensuring conservation of one of the planet's most valuable and renewable natural resources. It is also vital to retain consumer confidence in whatever new arrangements may be agreed – or the market as a whole will suffer.

The seafood supply paradox is that: in the UK, we export most of what we catch and import most of what we eat; most imports come from outside the EU; most of the markets for our own fleet are in EU; asymmetric trade flows risk complicating the negotiation of the future trade relationships, with the EU and beyond; new tariff or non-tariff barriers to trade, or new border or customs controls, could have significant effects on wider international supply chains.

There are multiple trade flows. Fish and seafood are among the most globally traded commodities. As a deficit market, the EU has a series of trade and other concessionary agreements with a range of countries (including GSP and EBA). It also operates a system of Autonomous Tariff Quotas (ATQs). Any or all of these could be included in an

EU/UK trade deal. There is no prima facie reason for the EU, or the UK, to become more protectionist in future. The UK market could even become more open.

12. Scottish Seafood Association. Jimmy Buchan.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752276/clg_mar2018_brexit_ssa.pdf

The reality of the situation for the Scottish processing sector is that in the last three decades, less than half seafood processors remain in Scotland due to high operating costs in a low margin industry and competing in a global market place. There has been a loss of skills in the labour work force with fish landings increasing and Scottish processing shrinking, and yet the industry offers numerous careers opportunities. To become more competitive in a global market SSA is rolling out a two year project to assist members attain an 'Approved Gold Standard Accreditation' with training across all levels of seafood, factory processing guidance to improve industry reputation and more interaction with Schools and colleges to make industry more accessible to interested parties.

13. NGO view. Helen McLachlan, World Wildlife Fund.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752279/clg_mar2018_brexit_wwf.pdf

There is a need to establish overarching objectives and principles that guide the implementation of fisheries legislation and decision making now and in the future. As such the key asks for the Fisheries Bill are: a commitment to manage fisheries sustainably as part of wider marine management; a commitment to setting sustainable fishing levels; a commitment to using clear criteria; and strong governance and Fully Documented Fisheries. A coalition of 17 supermarkets, processors and industry groups are calling for robust fisheries regulations and a Fisheries Bill that delivers confidence that UK seafood is sustainably and legally sourced. A statement from the group also called for strong monitoring measures to ensure that there is more visibility of what is happening on our fishing boats.

14. Fishing industry view. Dale Rodmell, National Federation of Fishermen's Organisations.

http://www.seafish.org/media/1752282/clg_mar2018_brexit_nffo.pdf

Fishing is seen as a high priority and a litmus test for how Brexit will work for the UK. The NFFO has clear objectives:

- The UK should, from the point of departure from the EU, have the status of an independent coastal state, with jurisdiction over the fisheries within its EEZ; along with
- an independent seat at the table when decisions on fisheries on shared stocks are made.
- A 12 mile exclusive limit should apply to safeguard to provide adequate protection for our
- coastal fisheries.
- The UK's quotas of shared stocks should broadly reflect the resources that are located within UK waters.
- Access for non-UK vessels to fish within the UK EEZ should bring balancing benefits to the UK.
- There should be scope and flexibility for the UK to shape and tailor its domestic fisheries management arrangements to fit with its own fleets.
- The UK should seek as unimpeded access to EU markets as possible.

Overall discussion

- **Question.** There has been a lot of talk about fisheries management and sustainable harvesting but not a lot about who will get this increased harvest if we maximise efficiency. Who in the UK will benefit from an increase in resources, or a re-allocation of resources? **Answer.** It should be the fishers who benefit from any quota uplift but in this situation there will be winners and losers. It should be the EU fleet who are the losers and potentially the under 10m vessels (with quota shortages) and local fishing communities who could benefit. Transparent and clear principles are needed but from an environmental perspective there must be a commitment to main fish stocks.
- There were comments over transitional arrangements and UNCLOS (United Nations Convention for the Law of the Sea). It is widely assumed that upon withdrawing from the EU, the UK will assume control of the UK EEZ. The UK will then become an independent coastal state bound by the obligations of UNCLOS and the Fish Stocks Agreement but this is not clear and needs to be addressed.
- **Q.** What are the possible alternatives to relative stability? **A.** Michael Gove has stated 'Fisheries management should always be guided by science - by a hard-headed assessment of which species and stocks can be fished and which must be protected if their numbers are not to dip below sustainable levels'. This would need to re-negotiated with a balance between wishing to have access to UK waters for the UK fleet and the amount of fish we want to be able to catch outside UK waters. The EU and the UK share about 100 stocks and we need to ensure fishing is at sustainable levels. There are also questions over when the UK leaves the EU where we take our scientific advice from? The UK leaving the EU represents an enormous challenge for the remaining states and could even threaten the CFP.
- Brexit is not about catching more fish it is about re-aligning what is currently caught. Fish should be fished and managed sustainably and there does need to be a re-negotiation of the rules.
- **Q.** If we assume (and hope) that industry will get the benefits of any re-negotiation do we have the infrastructure/processing capacity to the UK to deal with this? **A.** We need a managed transition so that this can be addressed. We need to grow into what is rightfully ours.
- This needs Government intervention and we also need a re-assurance about what will replace EMFF as this is what has driven innovation in the past.

15. Date of next meeting

The next CLG meeting will be on Wednesday 27 June 2018 at Friends House, London. The Common Language Group Steering Group will be discussing the agenda.